

Conflict from Compromise: The Anglo Irish Treaty

Thomas McKenna

Junior Division

Individual Performance

Process Paper: 495 words

The National History Day theme “Conflict and Compromise” turned my mind toward politics since political decisions can impact the lives of many. Because of my family ancestry in Ireland, I explored the idea of Irish politics. Background reading of tertiary sources such as BBC History and History.com led me to the quest for Irish independence. This narrower scope yielded reading of more focused sources until I finally decided upon one of the most significant and tangible steps in that quest for independence: the Anglo-Irish Treaty.

During further research, I read a paper titled “The Freedom to Achieve Freedom” which illustrated the conflict between Eamon de Valera and Michael Collins. This intriguing narrative inspired me to narrow my research to the conflict I would later nickname the Intra-Irish conflict, a conflict amplified by the compromise in the Anglo-Irish Treaty. I searched databases for both American and Irish newspaper articles on Irish politics and the Irish Civil War. Documents on Irish Foreign Policy, a project of various institutions, provided an extended collection of documents regarding the treaty including letters, memos and meeting minutes that were solid research gold. Secondary sources were also crucial to my research. The invaluable *Big Fellow, Long Fellow*, yielded detailed analysis and numerous direct quotations of Collins and de Valera. After extensive research I had a story--the intra-Irish conflict--ready to be told, I just needed a method to tell it.

Having explored the idea of a performance from the beginning, I wanted to portray characters who could engage the audience. Because of the numerous primary sources that would provide original historical dialogue, it seemed my best option. My most important decision in the writing process was designing the performance to be similar to a play rather than a lecture. I attempted to craft the performance to be as historically accurate as possible by incorporating direct quotations. Excluding the narrator and the characters’ first two speeches, written to present context, 60% of the characters’ lines are direct or minimally edited quotations. I endeavored to make the historical characters distinct. In terms of characterization, Michael Collins, the former soldier, was portrayed with a lower voice in a hunched

position while de Valera, the intellectual, spoke with a higher voice and stood with a conceited posture. I watched several of Lloyd George's speeches to match my portrayal with his cadence and style of speaking. Several aspects of the performance were crafted to portray the story, time period and characters.

Throughout my research, I learned that the intra-Irish conflict embodied the theme. It seemed peculiar to me that the Irish were in factions entering negotiations. After the agreement was signed, the division within Ireland would only grow and invert the way we view conflict and compromise today. In the end, Ireland's settlement was neither a failed compromise nor a perfect one. While the Anglo-Irish Treaty attempted to solve the conflict between Britain and Ireland it instead amplified the intra-Irish conflict to the point of civil war.

Conflict from Compromise: The Anglo Irish Treaty

Thomas McKenna

Junior Division

Individual Performance

Annotated Bibliography

Bibliography

Primary Sources

Historical Newspapers

Bronner, Milton. "More Deadly than War for Freedom." *The Seattle Star* (Seattle, WA), September 15, 1922. From the Library of Congress, *Chronicling America: Historic American Newspapers*.

<http://chroniclingamerica.loc.gov/lccn/sn87093407/1922-09-15/ed-1/seq-13/>.

This newspaper article in the *Seattle Star* captures the destruction caused by the Irish Civil War. It writes that "more grievous hurts have been done to Ireland in the two months civil war than the two years fighting between the British and the Irish." The narrator reads the article when summarizing the destruction that the Civil War brought to Ireland.

"Coercing Fellow Irishmen." *Irish Independent*, March 22, 1922. *Irish Newspaper Archive*.

<http://archive.irishnewsarchive.com/Olive/APA/INA/Default.aspx#panel=search>.

This *Irish Independent* article titled "Coercing Fellow Irishmen" accomplishes what its subtitle claims it accomplishes: it reports "How the Country Views Mr. De Valera's Civil War Threats." While it does not show all viewpoints of the country, the directly quoted Irishmen helped me comprehend the viewpoint of one side of the squabble.

"De Valera as Treaty Foe Will Run for Re-Election." *The Evening Herald* (Albuquerque, NM), January 6, 1922. From the Library of Congress, *Chronicling America: Historic American Newspapers*.

<http://chroniclingamerica.loc.gov/lccn/sn92070582/1922-01-06/ed-1/seq-1/>.

The Evening Herald presents de Valera's interests, intentions and perspectives in this article from January of 1922. The information the article provided helped me to grasp the events regarding the Dail Debates and presidential election. I used this article as background in the Dail portion of the performance.

"De Valera's Reasons for Rejection of Treaty." *Freemans Journal*, May 5, 1922. *Irish Newspaper Archive*.

<http://archive.irishnewsarchive.com/Olive/APA/INA/Default.aspx#panel=search>.

This article from the *Freemans Journal* relays de Valera's speech to a crowd in May of 1922 to the rest of Ireland. The newspaper clipping assisted me in understanding the many positions De Valera touches on in his speech. He states that he knows they cannot have peace because Irishmen and women would not allow themselves to become British subjects. Ironically, he rouses the Irish later in his speech by saying that, "They should stand up for their independence even at the risk of civil war, and they were not going to be dragooned into being British subjects even by their own countrymen." De Valera is, in effect, resisting the peace he appears to so desperately strive towards.

“Dramatic Arrest of De Valera.” *Donegal News*, August 18, 1923. *Irish Newspaper Archive*. <http://archive.irishnewsarchive.com/Olive/APA/INA/Default.aspx#panel=search>. The *Donegal News* tells the story of de Valera’s dramatic arrest by the Irish military. In my opinion, the most stunning part of the entire scene is the moment when de Valera shouts that “I have never stood for destruction, I have never stood for brother’s hand being raised against brother’s hand.” Although de Valera firmly states this, the Freeman’s Journal reports him in March of 1922 advocating for civil war. By reading this article, I realized that de Valera was one who would go along with the crowd, and, as with the majority of politicians, says what the people want to hear.

“Dublin Sensation, Four Courts Seized.” *Irish Examiner*, April 15, 1922. *Irish Newspaper Archive*. <http://archive.irishnewsarchive.com/Olive/APA/INA/Default.aspx#panel=search> The *Irish Examiner* gives a first-hand account of when anti-treaty forces occupied the Four Courts in Dublin. The article goes into extreme detail regarding events of sandbagging windows and using furniture as barricades. I used this source to gather information regarding the occupation of the Four Courts when trying to learn more about the specific events of the Irish Civil War.

“Eamon de Valera Denies His Policy Means Civil War.” *The Christian Science Monitor* (Boston, MA), April 12, 1922. *ProQuest Historical Newspapers*. <http://hngraphical.proquest.com.lcpl.idm.oclc.org/hnweb/hnpl/do/search>. This *Christian Science Monitor* article contained strong analysis and substantial depth of both British and Irish perspectives on the issues surrounding the treaty. On top of that, it provided me the necessary information to understand Michael Collins’ and Eamon de Valera’s views on the treaty. It included interviews with Collins and de Valera as well as Winston Churchill’s speech regarding the matters of the treaty. I used this article when articulating de Valera’s views but do not directly quote the article in the performance.

“Free State Head Slain In Ambush.” *The Rock Island Argus and Daily Union* (Rock Island, IL), August 23, 1922. From the Library of Congress, *Chronicling America: Historic American Newspapers*. <http://chroniclingamerica.loc.gov/lccn/sn92053933/1922-08-23/ed-1/seq-1/>. The shocking news of Collins’ assassination appeared on the front page of *The Rock Island Argus* on August 23 of 1922, reporting that he was shot at around 7:30 pm in the back of the ear and lived only a few minutes after being wounded. I utilized this newspaper by having the narrator hold up the front page in the Civil War segment of the performance.

“Head of Black and Tans Forced to Resign.” *Alexandria Gazette* (Alexandria, VA), February 23, 1921. From the Library of Congress, *Chronicling America: Historic American Newspapers*. <https://chroniclingamerica.loc.gov/lccn/sn85025007/1921-02-23/ed-1/seq-4/>. This newspaper explained that the leader of the Black and Tans, British police forces in Ireland during the War of Independence, was forced to resign after the war was coming to an end. I learned about the Black and Tans through this article from the *Alexandria*

Gazette that I would also use as background and orientation with the topic in the first few months of research.

“Interview in British Journal.” *Fermanagh Herald*, October 10, 1923. *Irish Newspaper Archive*. <http://archive.irishnewsarchive.com/Olive/APA/INA/Default.aspx#panel=search>. Almost a month after his arrest, de Valera had an interview with a representative of the Daily Mail. The *Fermanagh Herald* relayed that interview through this article to the Irish people. As stated in the newspaper, the Republican leader was still resisting the treaty even after it was accepted by both the Dail and Irish people, stating that, “Irish Republicans will never consent to surrender Ireland’s national independence and sovereignty to any threats or in any circumstances.” I utilized the article when researching beyond the few months in which my performance takes place to learn about the aftermath of the intra-Irish conflict.

Reeves, Earle C. “Slayings in Wave of Reprisals.” *The Lake County Times* (Hammond, IN), November 22, 1920. From the Library of Congress, *Chronicling America: Historic American Newspapers*. <http://chroniclingamerica.loc.gov/lccn/sn86058242/1920-11-22/ed-1/seq-1/>. As the article reports, 30 were killed and 70 injured on November 21, 1922. This day would come to be nicknamed “Bloody Sunday”. The article reports in detail about the different atrocities committed by both sides. I learned that tactics used by both sides could not be dismissed as honorable. I used this article to understand the War of Independence and its events such as “Bloody Sunday”.

“33 Slain in Ireland after 2 Days’ Fighting, Woman Shot Dead.” *New York Times* (New York, NY), May 17, 1921. *ProQuest Historical Newspaper*. <http://hngraphical.proquest.com.lcpl.idm.oclc.org/hnweb/hnpl/do/search>. As mentioned in the performance, the War for Independence didn’t necessarily include prolonged battles and battlefield warfare. I learned about the guerilla warfare tactics used by both sides from this source. This article written in May of 1921 reports of ambushes by the Irish and raids from the British, which illustrate the War for Independence. The narrator briefly references the tactics used in this war in the first scene of the performance.

Government Documents

Childers, Erskine. “Cabinet Meeting of December 8, 1921, copy of notes taken by Erskine Childers.” *Documents on Irish Foreign Policy*, December 8, 1921. <http://www.difp.ie/documents/1921treaty.pdf>. These minutes were originally handwritten in a small notebook by Erskine Childers, secretary to the Irish delegation, in order to document an Irish Cabinet meeting held directly after the signing of the Anglo-Irish Treaty. Childers’ account enabled me further understand that, after the signing of the treaty, the intra-Irish conflict had started to become a conflict not just happening but being documented on hard paper. I used the

notes as a basis for the dialogue in the Irish Cabinet scene, primarily the argument between Collins and de Valera.

“Declaration of Independence.” *Documents on Irish Foreign Policy*, January 21, 1919.

<http://www.difp.ie/docs/1919/Declaration-of-independence/1.htm>.

The Irish Declaration of Independence accuses the British of maintaining their rule over Ireland “by military occupation against the declared will of the people.” The document is often viewed as what prompted the Irish War for Independence. It goes on to declare an Irish Republic, and, similar to the American Declaration, sparks a war. Because I had the document, I could learn about the specific positions of those Irishmen opposed to British rule. I used it to provide efficient but necessary exposition in Collins’ first monologue.

“Dáil Éireann debate - Wednesday, 14 Dec 1921.” *Tithe an Oireachtais Houses of the Oireachtas*, December 14, 1921. <https://www.oireachtas.ie/en/debates/debate/dail/1921-12-14/>.

These minutes are from the first Dail session following the signing of the treaty. The website, Houses of the Oireachtas, compiles the minutes from every Dail meeting ever. One can read from the meeting that occurred the day before or the meeting that took place 100 years ago. In this specific meeting, members of the Dail discuss matter such as the delegation’s neglecting to alert the Cabinet of their planned signing and whether or not to enter a private session.

“Dáil Éireann debate - Saturday, 7 Jan 1922.” *Tithe an Oireachtais Houses of the Oireachtas*, January 7, 1922. <https://www.oireachtas.ie/en/debates/debate/dail/1922-01-07/2/>
January 7th is a most significant day in Irish history. In Dublin on that day, the Irish Dail ratified the Anglo-Irish Treaty by a vote of 64-57. Many other notable events besides the vote occurred during that meeting of the Dail that day, including the continuing debate on the treaty and de Valera’s statement that he wished “to go to the country and to the world.” I used this document to cite the exact vote count on the ratification of the treaty.

“Dáil Éireann debate - Tuesday, 10 Jan 1922” *Tithe an Oireachtais Houses of the Oireachtas*, January 10, 1922. <https://www.oireachtas.ie/en/debates/debate/dail/1922-01-10/2/>

Just two days after the ratification of the Anglo-Irish Treaty, the Dail moved to arrange the framework of the new Free State. The election of Arthur Griffith as President of the Dail was about to take place when de Valera walked out in protest of the election, saying that it was a motion to construct the Free State and, in effect, bring down the Republic. While all of his supporters followed, Collins rose and shouted, “Deserters all!” I use this exchange in my performance to illustrate the clash between de Valera and Collins.

Letters

Craig, James. Letter to David Lloyd George, *The National Archives of Ireland*, November 20, 1921.

<http://treaty.nationalarchives.ie/document-gallery/sir-james-craigs-letter-to-david-lloyd-george-20-november-1921/>.

Sir James Craig, who was the main head of the Unionists in Ulster, wrote this letter to Lloyd George informing him that he wished to stay united with Britain, something eventually achieved through means provided him in the treaty. This letter presented evidence of Lloyd George's demand of allegiance to the crown "without reservation" from Irish delegates. Although I do not directly quote the letter, the information in it is paraphrased regarding Lloyd George's point of view.

de Valera, Eamon. Letter to David Lloyd George, *Documents on Irish Foreign Policy*, September 30, 1921. <http://www.difp.ie/documents/1921treaty.pdf>.

As September neared its end, de Valera accepts the invitation via letter to the negotiations on the Anglo-Irish Treaty. While he himself did not attend the conference, he agreed to send the Irish delegation in order, "to explore every possibility of settlement by personal discussion." De Valera's letter provided me insight at his views and motives such as framing Collins into taking the blame for the compromise with the British. Though I do not directly quote this source, it supplied support to de Valera's motives as portrayed in the performance.

——— Letter to David Lloyd George, *Documents on Irish Foreign Policy*, July 8, 1921.

<http://www.difp.ie/documents/1921treaty.pdf>.

In this letter of correspondence, Eamon de Valera agrees to meet on behalf of the Irish to negotiate a truce to end the War for Independence. However, these negotiations were separate from the negotiations regarding the Anglo-Irish Treaty. The letter enabled me to understand de Valera's positions as they headed into negotiations.

Griffith, Arthur. Letter to Eamon de Valera, *Documents on Irish Foreign Policy*, November 29, 1921. <http://www.difp.ie/documents/1921treaty.pdf>.

Arthur Griffith writes in this letter regarding Lloyd George's comments on de Valera's External Association plan and the Oath of Allegiance. Including, but not limited to, how it would be "impossible" and "smashed to atoms" by the British Parliament. I used the letter as the backbone of the Lloyd George's first scene when he deems External Association unacceptable. Much of the dialogue and word choice in that scene is based on the original letter.

Images and Media

Anglo-Irish Treaty. *The National Archives of Ireland*, December 6, 1921. Photograph.

<http://treaty.nationalarchives.ie/document-gallery/anglo-irish-treaty-6-december-1921/>.

The Anglo-Irish Treaty was the settlement that would regulate and control relations between Ireland and Britain for the years to come. The treaty was the crux of my performance and by having the original copy I was able to read firsthand what it said. I

used the treaty regarding matters of its content in the performance but never directly quote the text.

“Mr Lloyd George Speaks To The Nation (1931).” Video file, 02:03. YouTube. Posted by British Pathe, April 14, 2014. Accessed April 18, 2018.

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=yXmlcGWdNs8>.

While the content of Lloyd George’s speech in this video has no relation to my topic, I learned this video to analyze Lloyd George’s cadence, intonation, volume and voice overall to best simulate his style of speaking. This footage allowed me to portray this historical figure in a more accurate way.

Lavery, John. *Portrait of Irish delegate Michael Collins. The National Archives of Ireland*, Illustration.

<http://treaty.nationalarchives.ie/document-gallery/delegates-images/michael-collins/>.

This portrait of Michael Collins by Sir John Lavery was used as a model for the simple but evidenced costuming of Collins. In the picture, Collins doesn’t wear a hat, which were common in the day. Similarly, Collins doesn’t wear a hat in the performance.

Treaty plenipotentiaries Arthur Griffith and Robert Barton preparing to depart for London from Dún Laoghaire, being seen off by Éamon de Valera. *The National Archives of Ireland*, October 1921. Photograph.

<http://treaty.nationalarchives.ie/document-gallery/delegates-images/treaty-plenipotentiaries-with-president-eamon-de-valera/>.

Although the main subjects of this photograph are Arthur Griffith and Robert Barton, the purpose of this photo in my research was actually Eamon de Valera. I used this photo when deciding the costuming and characterization of de Valera. As in the performance, de Valera has his spectacles on and has his hands behind his back.

David Lloyd George with his daughter. 1926. Photograph. Accessed February 21, 2018.

<http://www.alamy.com/stock-photo-david-lloyd-george-with-his-daughter-1926-36994143.html>.

Similar to the other photos, I used this image of David Lloyd George to determine his outfit. Specifically, I decided upon his hat to characterize him in my performance.

Secondary Sources

Interviews

Dorney, John, personal email correspondence, May 25, 2018.

My correspondence with Dorney presented me with yet another angle on the Irish Revolution. Dorney, an Irish historian and author of several books regarding the revolution and civil war, gave his thoughts and perspective on questions such as why Britain, a superpower in warfare, bothered with negotiations. He also directed me to a series of lectures by Professor Laffan on the Irish Revolution.

Dwyer, T. Ryle, personal email correspondence, March 29, 2018.

T. Ryle Dwyer is the definition of a historical expert. His master's thesis titled, "The Anglo-Irish Treaty and Why They Signed," was published in 1971, while his most recent book on Michael Collins was written in 2014. He had been studying and researching the quest for Irish independence for almost fifty years. Throughout my research he became someone I admired for his lifetime of work devoted to a topic I had only explored for a semester. In the correspondence, he explained why Britain didn't just overwhelm Ireland with its large military, how Ireland eventually achieved its full independence, and the bigger role the Anglo-Irish Treaty has in history. I used this correspondence to understand what de Valera's motives were. Dwyer's insight was what ultimately led me to believe that de Valera had framed Collins into staining his reputation.

Knirck, Jason, personal email correspondence, May 25, 2018.

James Knirck, author of *Imagining Ireland's Independence: The Debates Over the Anglo-Irish Treaty of 1921*, provided me even deeper insight into the motives backing moves on both sides of the negotiations table. Why de Valera chose not to attend negotiations and how Ireland eventually achieved full independence are among the subjects Professor Knirck addressed in my correspondence with him. I used Professor Knirck's responses to clarify one of the more mysterious aspects of the topic: the reasons for sending certain individuals to negotiations.

Books

Dwyer, T. Ryle. *Big Fellow, Long Fellow: A Joint Biography of Collins and de Valera*. Dublin, Ireland: Gill & Macmillan, 1998.

T. Ryle Dwyer, author of dozens of books on Irish politics, in his book *Big Fellow, Long Fellow*, explores the lives of both Collins and de Valera in a joint biography. The book contains many chapters centered on the Anglo-Irish Treaty and the Civil War. From this source, I learned about negotiations, the plenipotentiaries' motives, the Dail Debates and the Civil War. I utilized this source by adding original dialogue into the script in sections such as de Valera's reason for remaining in Ireland, the Dail scene and Collins' reflection on the Civil War. Ultimately, Dwyer provided information and analysis on all of the distinct topics mentioned.

Hegarty, Neil. *The Story of Ireland*. New York, NY: St. Martin's Press, 2012.

The Story of Ireland is an overarching, all-encompassing book covering much, if not, all of the history of the emerald isle. I read a specific chapter for my research titled "revolution" which captured the most significant events from the Easter Rising of 1916 to the end of the Irish Civil War. This chapter yielded a ten page comprehensive account of the quest for Irish independence.

Pakenham, Frank. *Peace by Ordeal*. 4th ed. London, UK: Sidgwick & Jackson, 1972.

Frank Pakenham's *Peace by Ordeal* was yet another vital resource when looking for information regarding the specifics of the intra-Irish conflict. For example, the book was also able to supply original lines of dialogue and passages including Lloyd George's

ultimatum of war, Collins' "freedom to achieve freedom" quotation, his stepping stone analogy and Arthur Griffith's quotation in the final scene. Most of all, the book presented the facts and nuances of the negotiations. For instance, all three members of the cabinet who would later oppose the treaty, including de Valera, remained in Ireland instead of attending negotiations.

Scholarly Articles

Heintz, Matthew. "The Freedom to Achieve Freedom: Negotiating the Anglo-Irish Treaty." *Intersections* 10, no. 1 (Winter 2009): 431-51. Accessed January 2, 2018.
https://depts.washington.edu/chid/intersections_Winter_2009/Matthew_Heintz_Anglo-Irish_Treaty.pdf.

"The Freedom to Achieve Freedom" was the first paper I read regarding what I would later call the intra-Irish conflict. It provided supported analysis and information on topics including: guerrilla warfare, the Irish delegation, the association with the crown, the Ulster question and the aftermath and effects of the treaty. I used this source as a basis for when conveying the intra-Irish conflict.

McCormack, Mike. "Civil War Comes to Ireland in June." *Ancient Order of Hibernians*. Last modified June 4, 2017. Accessed February 20, 2018.

<https://aoh.com/2017/06/04/civil-war-comes-to-ireland-in-june/>.

Mike McCormack is an established author in Ireland who writes articles on history for the Ancient Order of Hibernians' website. I read the article to gain background knowledge regarding the Irish Civil War; it provided information such as the number of casualties and explained the events of the occupation of the Four Courts.

Morrogh, Michael. "The Anglo-Irish Treaty of 1921." *History Review*. December 2000. Accessed

May 30, 2018. http://go.galegroup.com/ps/i.do?p=STOM&u=loudoun_main&id=GALE|A68644802&v=2.1&it=r&sid=STOM&asid=31fc2690.

Morrogh, author of *The Irish Century*, presents several aspects of the Anglo-Irish conflict in his article featured in *History Review*. First, he points out similarities between the Anglo-Irish negotiations and the Good Friday agreement. He also paints the overall picture of Ireland's quest for independence. I utilized this article at times in my research when I needed a bird's eye view of the conflict between Britain and Ireland.